# Bridging the Gap: Towards machine learning that matters in healthcare

Leo Anthony Celi MD MS MPH MIT Institute for Medical Engineering & Science Beth Israel Deaconess Medical Center, Harvard Medical School





# Disclosures

- No conflict of interest relevant to this presentation.
- Research funding from
  - National Institute of Health
  - Philips Healthcare
  - -SAP
  - Amazon
  - Microsoft





# Laboratory of Computational Physiology

MIT Critical Data Sana PhysioNet





### Crowdsourcing Knowledge Discovery Medical Information Mart for Intensive Care







#### Critical Data

NEWS ABOUT ~ PAST EVENTS ~ COURSE

Empowering Big Data in Critical Care



#### Transforming Critical Care

In many areas of science, government and business, analyzing very large amounts of information- Big Data- has become a major driver of innovation and success. In critical care, EHRs and collaborative approaches mean we are facing our own Data Revolution.



#### Meaningful Use of Big Data

Large amounts of data originating from critical care needs to be de-identified, analyzed and curated for it to be mined effectively. Clinicians and Data scientists must work together to understand and explore the meaningful, secondary use of Critical Care data.  $\propto^{0}$ 

#### **Transforming Healthcare**

Our vision is for the development of a care system consisting of Clinical Informatics without walls, in which the creation of evidence and clinical decision support tools in initiated, updated, honed and enhanced by scaling the access and meaningful use of Clinical Data.



### criticaldata.mit.edu



#### Critical Data

NEWS ABOUT ~ PAST EVENTS ~ COURSE

# Announcing Our Fall 2016 Critical Data Course

HST.953: Secondary Analysis of Health Data

**COURSE INFORMATION** 





کے Search	ringer				Q ¥
Home	Subjects	Services	Products	Springer Shop	About us
» Public	c Health				
© 2016	;				
© 2016 Open A	Access	Seco	ndary A	Analysis	of
© 2016 Open A MIT C B & Seco Ana Elec Hea	Access	Secon Elect Authors: MI	ndary A ronic I	Analysis Health Re	of ecords



Written with the aim of promoting an inter-disciplinary and ethical approach to health data analytics





#### Contents 06 APRIL 2016 VOL 8, ISSUE 333

#### PERSPECTIVE

#### A "datathon" model to support cross-disciplinary collaboration

BY JERÔME ABOAB, LEO ANTHONY CELI, PETER CHARLTON, MENGLING FENG, MOHAMMAD GHASSEMI, DOMINIC C. MARSHALL, LOUIS MAYAUD, TRISTAN NAUMANN, NED MCCAGUE, KENNETH E. PAIK, TOM J. POLLARD, MATTHIEU RESCHE-RIGON, JUSTIN D. SALCICCIOLI, DAVID J. STONE

SCIENCE TRANSLATIONAL MEDICINE | 06 APR 2016 : 333PS8 | 🖨

A "datathon" model combines complementary knowledge and skills to formulate inquiries and drive research that addresses information gaps faced by clinicians.

Abstract | Full Text | 🕒 PDF

#### MORE FROM SCIENCE TRANSLATIONAL MEDICINE

- Current Table of Contents
- Archive
- In the Pipeline
- About Science Translational Medicine
  - Mission and Scope
- Editors and Advisory Boards
- Editorial Policies
- Information for Authors
- Information for Reviewers
- Staff









#### Openly available database

eICU is a large multi-center ICU database made available by Philips Healthcare in partnership with the MIT Lab for Computational Physiology.



















University College London Hospitals **NHS Foundation Trust** 



Oxford University Hospitals NHS Trust









### sana.mit.edu





### HST.936: Global Health Informatics to Improve Quality of Care









Universidad del Cauca









### Massive Open Online Course

HOW IT WORKS COURSES SCHOOLS & PARTNERS REGISTER NOW



Study, have fun, uncover a new passion or learn skills that just may change your life.





Learn more: take the new edX Demo course here. More questions? Read our FAQ

log in









# PROJECTS



#### Solving All the Wrong Problems



Allison Arieff JULY 9, 2016

Every day, innovative companies promise to make the world a better place. Are they succeeding?

Here is just a sampling of the products, apps and services that have come across my radar in the last few weeks:

A service that sends someone to fill your car with gas.

A service that sends a valet on a scooter to you, wherever you are, to park your car.

A service that will film anything you desire with a drone.

A service that will pack your suitcase - virtually.

A service that delivers a new toothbrush head to your mailbox every three months.

A service that delivers your beer right to your door.

An app that analyzes the quality of your French kissing.

























Established in 1989 in response to an Institute of Medicine report that pointed out

"escalating healthcare costs, wide variations in medical practice patterns, and evidence that some health services are of little or no value"







### Best Available Evidence

#### Patient Preferences EBM Clincal Judgement





# Evidence-Based Medicine University

- McMaster University
- Exercise caution in the interpretation of information derived from clinical experience and intuition, for it may at times be misleading
- The understanding of physiology and basic mechanisms of disease is necessary but insufficient guides for clinical practice.
- Understanding rules of evidence is necessary to correctly interpret literature on causation, prognosis, diagnostic tests, and treatment strategy.

# How well is evidence-based medicine working?







RESEARCH ARTICLE

### Financial Relationships between Organizations That Produce Clinical Practice Guidelines and the Biomedical Industry: A Cross-Sectional Study

Paul Campsall<sup>1</sup>, Kate Colizza<sup>2</sup>, Sharon Straus<sup>3</sup>, Henry T. Stelfox<sup>4,5,6,7,8</sup>\*

1 Department of Critical Care Medicine, University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta, Canada, 2 Department of Medicine, University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta, Canada, 3 Department of Medicine, Li Ka Shing Knowledge Institute, St. Michael's Hospital, University of Toronto, Toronto, Ontario, Canada, 4 Department of Critical Care Medicine, University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta, Canada, 5 Department of Community Health Sciences, University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta, Canada, 6 Department of Medicine, University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta, Canada, 6 Department of Calgary, Calgary, Calgary, Alberta, Canada, 7 O'Brien Institute for Public Health, University of Calgary, Calgary, Alberta, Canada, 8 Alberta Health Services, Calgary, Alberta, Canada







### Practice Guidelines and Conflict of Interest

- Majority of organizations (63%) that published clinical practice guidelines received funds from biomedical companies.
- Very few (1%) of the published clinical practice guidelines disclosed financial relationships.





CINCLE PRACTICE BUDGELINES WE CAN TREAST	Clinical Practice Guidelines We Can Trust
ISBN 978-0-309-16422-1 300 pages 6 x 9 PAPERBACK (2011)	Robin Graham, Michelle Mancher, Dianne Miller Wolman, Sheldon Greenfield, and Earl Steinberg, Editors; Committee on Standards for Developing Trustworthy Clinical Practice Guidelines; Institute of Medicine

- For many clinical domains, high-quality evidence is lacking, or even non-existent
- Often rely on low-quality evidence or expert opinion





# Medical Pendulum

- Treatment or test considered beneficial one decade is deemed of no value or even harmful the next
- Examples:
  - Pulmonary artery catheterization in the intensive care unit
  - Estrogen replacement for women after menopause
  - Tight control of blood sugar among those with type 2 diabetes





## Harrison's 1978 Management of Myocardial Infarction

- Rest in bed for 6 weeks
- Toilet use only after 2 weeks
- Avoid beta-blockers
- Lidocaine infusion to suppress ectopic beats
- No angiography (unstable plaque)







- Up to 98,000 die each year from preventable harm
- Based on 1984 data developed from reviews of medical records of patients treated in New York hospitals







Journal of Patient Safety: September 2013 - Volume 9 - Issue 3 - p 122–128 doi: 10.1097/PTS.0b013e3182948a69 Review Article

A New, Evidence-based Estimate of Patient Harms Associated with Hospital Care

James, John T. PhD

- An updated estimate is developed from modern studies published 2008-2011
- Number of premature deaths associated with preventable harm estimated at >400,000 per







The Journal of the American Medical Association

#### VIEWPOINT

Ashish Jha, MD, MPH Department of Health Policy and Management, Harvard T. H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, Massachusetts.

#### Peter Pronovost, MD, PhD

Armstrong Institute for Patient Safety and Quality, Johns Hopkins Medicine, Baltimore, Maryland.



**Toward a Safer Health Care System** The Critical Need to Improve Measurement

- Whether meaningful progress has occurred within patient safety is controversial.
  - Biggest obstacle: measuring patient safety
- Current strategy uses administrative data with low validity (vs. clinical data)





The lournal of the American Medical Association

#### VIEWPOINT

Ashish Jha, MD, MPH Department of Health Policy and Management, Harvard T. H. Chan School of Public Health, Boston, Massachusetts.

#### Peter Pronovost, MD, PhD

Armstrong Institute for Patient Safety and Quality, Johns Hopkins Medicine, Baltimore, Maryland.



Toward a Safer Health Care System The Critical Need to Improve Measurement

- Causes of iatrogenic harm: ADE, nosocomial infections, diagnostic errors, surgical complications, VTE, decubitus ulcers, falls
- Validated, clinically based approach to measuring only 1 (nosocomial infections) of the 7



#### JAMA The Journal of the American Medical Association

Home Current Issue All Issues Online First Collections CME Multimedia

#### December 15, 2015, Vol 314, No. 23 >

< Previous Article Subscribe/Learn More Next Article	Article
--	---------

Viewpoint | December 15, 2015

### Measurement Is Essential for Improving Diagnosis and Reducing Diagnostic Error A Report From the Institute of Medicine

Elizabeth A. McGlynn, PhD1; Kathryn M. McDonald, MM2,3; Christine K. Cassel, MD4

The average US patient can expect to be harmed by a diagnostic error at some point.





#### Table. Common Causes of Hospital Adverse Events and Potential Measures and Data Sources

Events	Potential Measures	Data Sources From Electronic Health Records
Adverse drug events	Allergic reactions, elevated blood creatinine following nephrotoxin prescription, prescription of antidotes (eg, naloxone)	Order entry, laboratory results, clinical notes for confirmation
Deep vein thrombosis (DVT)	Rate of postoperative DVT, rate of pulmonary embolism, laboratory abnormalities (eg, elevated D-dimer)	Radiology reports, laboratory results, clinical notes for confirmation
Falls	Rate of falls among older patients	Nursing notes, clinical notes, radiology reports
Decubitus ulcers	Rate of decubitus ulcers	Nursing notes, physician notes, nurse-completed single-question ulcer assessment
Nosocomial pneumonia	Rate of nosocomial pneumonia	Nursing notes, laboratory results, radiology reports
Diagnostic errors	Rate of missed diagnosis of acute myocardial infarction	Clinical notes, electrocardiogram, laboratory results

 Harness clinical data from EHR to develop algorithms for detecting the other leading causes of prevent able harm





#### Machine Learning that Matters

KIRI.L.WAGSTAFF@JPL.NASA.GOV Jet Propulsion Laboratory, California Institute of Technology, 4800 Oak Grove Drive, Pasadena, CA 91109 USA

- Proliferation of ML papers that evaluate algorithms on isolated benchmark datasets
- Results rarely communicated back to the origin of the dataset: no emphasis on connecting ML advances to the real world
- Improvements in performance rarely accompanied by an assessment of whether those gains matter to the world outside of ML research











# Area under the ROC

- Summarizes performance over all possible regimes even if they are unlikely ever to be used (e.g. extremely high false positive rates)
- Weights false positives and false negatives equally, which may be inappropriate for a given problem domain
- Insufficiently grounded to meaningfully measure impact





#### Machine Learning that Matters

KIRI.L.WAGSTAFF@JPL.NASA.GOV Jet Propulsion Laboratory, California Institute of Technology, 4800 Oak Grove Drive, Pasadena, CA 91109 USA

"It is easy to run an algorithm on a dataset you downloaded. It is very hard to identify a problem for which ML may offer a solution, determine what data should be collected, select or extract relevant features, choose an appropriate learning method, select an evaluation method, interpret the results, publicize the results to the relevant community, persuade users to adopt the technique, and (only then) to truly have made a difference."





# Predictive Algorithms in Sepsis

GILALIUIIS







# The NEW ENGLAND JOURNAL of MEDICINE

### Accelerating Innovation in Health IT

Robert S. Rudin, Ph.D., David W. Bates, M.D., and Calum MacRae, M.B., Ch.B., Ph.D.







### The Divide between Health IT Developers and the Users (Clinicians and Patients)





# Divide between Health IT Developers and Users

- Health IT developers in IT companies, startups, or academic research departments have little to no contact with patients and clinicians and often lack a deep understanding of users' needs.
- Startups: developers are young and healthy, with little firsthand knowledge of clinicians or the chronically ill patients who consume most health care services.





# Divide between Health IT Developers and Users

- Venture capital clustered in wellness companies making products such as fitness trackers that cannot help the patients most in need and thus will have little effect on health care costs
- Some startups target clinicians and chronically ill patients, but generally underestimate the effort needed to understand such complex and diverse users.





# Divide between Health IT Developers and Users

- Tools built on the basis of fundamental misconceptions about clinical utility of new data sources (e.g., episodic blood pressure and glucose readings, accelerometry)
- Incorrect design assumptions about when and how clinicians are available to respond to data produced by monitoring devices and when such contact is appropriate and clinically useful





# Breaking Down the Silos







### Contents 06 APRIL 2016 VOL 8, ISSUE 333

#### PERSPECTIVE

#### A "datathon" model to support cross-disciplinary collaboration

BY JERÔME ABOAB, LEO ANTHONY CELI, PETER CHARLTON, MENGLING FENG, MOHAMMAD GHASSEMI, DOMINIC C. MARSHALL, LOUIS MAYAUD, TRISTAN NAUMANN, NED MCCAGUE, KENNETH E. PAIK, TOM J. POLLARD, MATTHIEU RESCHE-RIGON, JUSTIN D. SALCICCIOLI, DAVID J. STONE

SCIENCE TRANSLATIONAL MEDICINE | 06 APR 2016 : 333PS8 |

A "datathon" model combines complementary knowledge and skills to formulate inquiries and drive research that addresses information gaps faced by clinicians.

Abstract | Full Text | 🖾 PDF







### NIH Public Access Author Manuscript

Harv Med Stud Rev. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2015 February 13.

Published in final edited form as: Harv Med Stud Rev. 2015 January ; 2(1): 24–27.

#### Preparing a New Generation of Clinicians for the Era of Big Data

Ari Moskowitz, MD<sup>1</sup>, Jakob McSparron, MD<sup>1</sup>, David J. Stone, MD<sup>3</sup>, and Leo Anthony Celi, MD, MPH, MS<sup>1,2,\*</sup>







# The NEW ENGLAND JOURNAL of MEDICINE

### Accelerating Innovation in Health IT

Robert S. Rudin, Ph.D., David W. Bates, M.D., and Calum MacRae, M.B., Ch.B., Ph.D.

- Few are trained to specify ideas in a way that can be turned into workable software or understand IT capabilities well enough to propose technically feasible approaches.
- Experienced clinicians may have difficulty imagining how their workflows may be altered or processes re-engineered.







#### NIH Public Access Author Manuscript

Harv Med Stud Rev. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2015 February 13.

Published in final edited form as: Harv Med Stud Rev. 2015 January ; 2(1): 24–27.

#### Preparing a New Generation of Clinicians for the Era of Big Data

Ari Moskowitz, MD<sup>1</sup>, Jakob McSparron, MD<sup>1</sup>, David J. Stone, MD<sup>3</sup>, and Leo Anthony Celi, MD, MPH, MS<sup>1,2,\*</sup>

Creating a medical culture that is aware of and respectful of the importance and potential power of data for supporting and improving both practice and research may be the most important and ultimately effective element.







#### NIH Public Access Author Manuscript

Harv Med Stud Rev. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2015 February 13.

Published in final edited form as: Harv Med Stud Rev. 2015 January ; 2(1): 24–27.

#### Preparing a New Generation of Clinicians for the Era of Big Data

Ari Moskowitz, MD<sup>1</sup>, Jakob McSparron, MD<sup>1</sup>, David J. Stone, MD<sup>3</sup>, and Leo Anthony Celi, MD, MPH, MS<sup>1,2,\*</sup>

Making a prolific researcher requires instilling healthy skepticism and critical thinking skills, and understanding what evidence-based medicine truly means.





### Institutional Support for Collaboration

Icahn Institute for Genomics & Multiscale Biology Department of Genetics & Genomic Sciences >

> >300 people with backgrounds across hardware design, big data computing, and gene sequencing linked with disease centers within Mount Sinai Health System





# Institutional Support for Collaboration

### US Department of Veterans Affairs Big Data Scientist Training Enhancement Program







# The NEW ENGLAND JOURNAL of MEDICINE

### Accelerating Innovation in Health IT

Robert S. Rudin, Ph.D., David W. Bates, M.D., and Calum MacRae, M.B., Ch.B., Ph.D.

- Developing a thorough understanding of needs through direct interaction with users
- Most organizations underinvest in this critical activity!





### **PHILIPS** Research Award for Clinicians

Program information

Faculty Information

**Clinician Information** 

Contact

#### **Funding Announcement**

The **MIT-Philips Research Awards for Clinicians Program** is designed to recruit frontline clinicians - physicians, pharmacists, nurses, respiratory and other therapists - to engage in collaborative research with MIT and Philips investigators. The program will provide an opportunity for clinical professionals to conduct original research in collaboration with experienced MIT and Philips Research investigators. It is intended to further engage the clinical community with the MIT-Philips collaboration and to accelerate the discovery of new ideas with high translational potential.

The program will provide to clinicians:

- 1. An opportunity to build collaborative relationships with MIT faculty and Philips Research investigators.
- 2. Salary support of \$50,000 (plus associated MIT indirect costs) to cover 50% of the clinician's time for research.
- 3. The opportunity to advance great ideas from the clinical setting to the research development laboratories of two world renowned centers of discovery.

The program will provide to MIT faculty members:

- 1. A funded part-time clinician to collaborate on a research project of mutual interest.
- 2. An opportunity to collaborate with a researcher at Philips Research of North America, including the possibility of developing joint proposals for funding under the MIT-Philips Research Alliance.







# The NEW ENGLAND JOURNAL of MEDICINE

### Accelerating Innovation in Health IT

Robert S. Rudin, Ph.D., David W. Bates, M.D., and Calum MacRae, M.B., Ch.B., Ph.D.

- IT benefits from other industries do not result from "paving the cow path."
- Major transformations occur after intensive process reengineering.
- Changes will require not just knowledge of current user needs, but the imagination to address needs that users haven't even yet considered.





# Solving the Wrong Problems?



"Physicians use diagnostics less than optimally, but it is not clear that healthy people or patients can be trained to use diagnostics more wisely."

- John Ioannidis

- The notion of patients and healthy people being repeatedly tested sounds revolutionary.
- But even if tests were accurate, when performed in massive scale and multiple times, over-diagnosis and overtreatment will increase, as errors accumulate with multiple testing.





# Current Staff

Jerome Aboab **Miguel Armengol** Lucas Bulgarelli Leo Anthony Celi Christina Chen Alon Dagan **Rodrigo Deliberato** Nicolas Della Pena Mohammad Ghassemi

- 8 PhD
- 8 MD
- 1 MBA
- 1 MPH
- 2 SM
- 1 MEng

- Alistair Johnson Matthieu Komorowski Li Lehman
- Ken Paik
  - Tom Pollard
  - Jesse Raffa
  - Felipe Torres Chen Xie
    - Xiaopeng Zhao

**Director: Professor Roger Mark** 



